Guiding Questions for This Presentation

- How is the term equity defined and interpreted by dual language immersion practitioners (teachers and administrators)?
- What program- and classroom-level policies and practices do practitioners believe contribute to an equitable environment?

Participants

- Elementary, Spanish/English dual language practitioners (two-way immersion)
- 15 participants
  - 10 teachers, 3 administrators, 2 teacher/administrators
  - Balance of grade levels and languages taught
  - Balance of White and Hispanic participants
  - 2-37 years teaching (average 15.5 years)

- 14 programs
  - Balance of urban, suburban, town
  - 7 West, 2 Southwest, 2 Midwest, 3 East
  - Diverse program contexts

Study Methods

- Interview 1
  - Definition of equity in terms of dual language education
  - Examples of equity or inequity in your program or classroom

- Interview 2
  - Examination of 6 key points from the Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education
  - What would a strong program look like? A weak program?

Overall Findings

- Wide variety of definitions across the group
- Each individual provided multifaceted definitions
- Challenges encountered help to define equity
Findings: Elements of Ideal Equity

1. Practitioners cultivate an environment where English and Spanish have equal status.
2. Students of diverse ethno-linguistic backgrounds are positioned and recognized as equals.
3. The curriculum and program model reflect the goals of bilingualism and biliteracy.
4. Multicultural curriculum and materials are used.
5. Students have access to the curriculum and to educational resources.

English and Spanish Have Equal Status

“It never ceases to amaze me how much we continually have to combat the power and the influence of English.”
90/10 administrator

- Language ideology affects practice
- Status of Spanish raised by teachers

Challenges to equity between English and Spanish

- Motivation
- Assessment
- Quality and availability of Spanish materials
- Authentic texts

Encouraging Spanish language proficiency and use

- Sheltered instruction
- What’s different about encouraging Spanish L2 use compared to English L2 use?
- Communication for authentic purposes
- Using language management system
- Separation of languages for instruction

Language use at the program and school level

- Program model
- Use of Spanish among adults in the building, especially leadership, validates Spanish as language for communication
- Use of Spanish orally and in writing for routine matters

Diverse Students Positioned as Equals

“I guess the nature of dual immersion has made it just that everybody’s a language learner and everybody’s a language model, so that being the case... I don’t notice any sense of [differentiating between] the kids that have things and the kids that don’t have things like you might see in another program, because everybody has an active role and everyone’s a language learner. So you don’t have the ones who know and the ones who don’t know. Everybody doesn’t know something, and everybody knows something.”
90/10 Teacher/Administrator
- "We’re in this together"
  - Mixed L1/L2 classrooms an authentic way to equalize status
  - Creates a sense of empathy and respect for the learning process
  - Safe environment for language learners to take risks
  - Teachers facilitate opportunities for students to challenge their beliefs about kids who are different from them

[One administrator] reported that several years ago, in the first year of dual language program implementation at her very ethnically-diverse school, students were self-segregating on the playground by ethnicity. In the second year, staff began to facilitate two new strategies: They instituted games on the playground that all students would play together and they began to use the "pair-sharing" strategy in the classroom, where students would discuss something in pairs before being asked to share their answer with the class.

She reported that pair-sharing gave students the opportunity to help each other... She said, "so in that regard, they were seeing, ‘oh! I can help you. I can support you when you don’t know. But you can also support me when I ask you.’." In the second year of the program, students were more willing to socialize across demographic lines, and she attributes the improvement in interaction between students of different ethnicities to this facilitation of interaction between students on the playground and in the classroom.

- Race/ethnicity
  - Atmosphere that diversity is a strength
  - Discussing what kids notice about difference, biases that come from the outside

“Equity means teaching what is required of me to teach them—content standards—and in addition it also means that I am preparing them for beyond high school for things to make them, in my opinion, good citizens: go out into the real world, apply what they’ve learned, apply the language that they learned, in a way that they’re going to be able to participate in our society in a democratic way, and also in a caring way....”

90/10 5th-6th grade teacher
Multicultural Curriculum and Materials Are Used

- Curriculum and materials reflect diversity
  - Connect to students’ backgrounds
  - Help students see others’ perspectives
- Curriculum includes cross-cultural and social justice themes
  - Seek missing perspectives
  - Challenge: time and structured curriculum
- Pedagogical framework that works for diverse student backgrounds/needs

Inclusive and appreciative at the school level
- Celebrations
- Non-Hispanic languages and cultures

Empowering parents
- Involvement
- Communication
- Understanding different parent involvement paradigms

Access to the Curriculum and to Resources

- Access to the curriculum, to education
- Access to the dual language program
  - Support for all students who want to participate
  - Outreach to parents
- Meeting student learning needs
  - Instructional strategies/framework
  - High expectations with differentiation

Equity among strands
- Fairness of resource distribution
- Communication

Ms. Jiménez noticed a tension in her strand program in that the monolingual program teachers felt that it was unfair that the dual language teachers had fewer students in their classroom than the monolingual classes, although the reason was that the program was having trouble keeping students enrolled into the upper elementary grades. When she was discussing this in the lunch room with another dual language teacher, her colleague admonished her, …

“I think one of the hardest things is just when we compare ourselves to other schools… the things our kids are struggling with at home are so dramatic. I like that we’re pushed to be at the level of other schools, but also sometimes it’s just like, how can you expect us to meet that with the same teacher resources that other schools have? We have kids with such incredible emotional issues, or who experience abuse at home…. If they really want schools to be equal, equality often means dollars. So, yeah, we could give these kids what they need, but if we had a lot more accessible to us.”

50/50 1st grade teacher
“You need to keep your voice low. Don’t be talking about these things because then they’re going to hear.” When she said “they’re going to hear,” she was referring to the union people and to the other teachers who were mainstream. And I said, “You know what? I don’t care if they hear. They need to hear these things, because that way they’ll know why we have 18 in our classrooms, not 30, and that way there aren’t these assumptions about us.”…
Linguistic and Cultural Equity

Equity in the Guiding Principles for DL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STRAND</th>
<th>3 Instruction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Criteria</td>
<td>Teachers create a multilingual and multicultural learning environment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion

- What are aspects of your program/classroom that you would point to as fostering linguistic and cultural equity?
  - Think about language status, positioning students as equals, reflecting the goals of bilingualism and biliteracy in the program model, using multicultural materials, and providing access

- What might you do to foster cultural and linguistic equity even more?